PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING IN BELO HORIZONTE FIFTEEN YEARS

1993 – 2008
A city is a result of our dreams and our work. For the last fifteen years, Participatory Budgeting (PB) has shown us that when we sum our efforts, we are able to multiply the results. Through the PB, communities discuss and decide on what investments should be carried out by the local administration in its region. Through the meetings and the Comforça, the wishes of the residents turned into reality. This year we are concluding 1000 public works with resources summing up approximately US $170 million.

The PB is one of the trademarks of this administration: participatory management. Popular participation is directly responsible for the implementation of a public policy that respects the sovereign decision of the population. This produced in our city the qualification of citizenry, where the right to choose is exerted in democratic and equalitarian spaces, represented by the popular assemblies. The result is the implementation of public infrastructure, sewage treatment, and other public service works in all the city’s regions. Some of these works were necessary and in some cases urgently needed by the population and were all carried out to improve the well-being of the community.

With the introduction of the Digital Participatory Budgeting in 2006, we increased popular participation even more. Through the internet, communities chose important public works for both their regions and for the entire city. The efficiency of our PB transformed itself into a model for other Brazilian cities and it has been recognized worldwide as a successful experience. Currently our PB is a theme of study in universities and international organizations such as the World Bank, the Inter-American Development Bank (BID), the Mercocidades Network, Ford Foundation and the International Network of Cities (Urbal). Our PB is a model of democratic and transparent management, turning Belo Horizonte into an international reference, able to improve the quality of life of all those that chose this city to live and build their future.

FERNANDO PIMENTEL
Mayor of the City of Belo Horizonte
Democratic governments are built with the participation of all parties and stakeholders. The experiences and social advancements which were gained through the last fifteen years of Participatory Budgeting history in Belo Horizonte were decisive for the consolidation of this process and for the celebration of exerting true citizenry. It is a history that is full of lessons learned and of many victories, marked by transparency and popular participation.

The Participatory Budgeting program adopted by the Municipality of Belo Horizonte inaugurated a new form of governance marked by the decentralization of attributions and powers at the municipal level. Popular participation gained a significant role in the conception, planning and implementation of public policies together with the public administration, turning this style of governance into a national and international reference of participatory management.

Through the PB, the Municipality and the city implemented best urban practices. Through this process the capital of the most beautiful horizon, builds a more liveable place.
The attainment of the historic milestone of 1000 public works of the Participatory Budgeting Program is, without a doubt, a reason of great pride for the staff of the Municipality and for the thousands of men and women from all corners of the city that believed that it is possible to make dreams come true.

If it was possible for the public administration to accumulate the managerial knowledge to plan broader projects for the well-being of the city, I am sure that within the general population a new belief bloomed - cities that are built collectively are more democratic and thus reflect the diversity present in our society.

Today, Belo Horizonte can be proud of being the city with the longest-standing experience and uninterrupted Participatory Budgeting Program. It represents an accumulation of fifteen years of planning and execution of public works, guaranteeing better conditions and quality of life for the entire city.

MURILLO DE CAMPOS VALADARES
Municipal Secretary of Urban Policies
Participatory Budgeting changed the city, gave citizenry to those that did not have it and gave the right to define the priorities of public investments, improving the quality of life of the poorest regions. Through social mobilizations we gained 1000 public works, a victory that was celebrated in 2008. This demonstrates that the program was well succeeded and that it is here to stay, cherished by all residents and communities of Belo Horizonte. I am proud of being part of this history, because I feel that I took part in building the city.
INDEX

Introduction ........................................................................................................................................13

15 years, 1,000 public works: the population defines the development of the city ........................................15

Modalities of Participatory Budgeting in Belo Horizonte .................................................................21

Housing Participatory Budgeting and the Defence for Decent Housing .................................27

The PB goes online .............................................................................................................................31
Planning Instruments to improve the execution of PB.................................37
Leadership Development...........................................................................43
The PB of Belo Horizonte is a reference in Brazil and in the world..............47
The Map of Belo Horizonte and the interventions........................................51
AS REUNIÕES
DO ORÇAMENTO
PARTICIPATIVO
ESTÃO COMEÇANDO.
PARTICIPE!

1.000 OBRAS
DO ORÇAMENTO PARTICIPATIVO

PREFEITURA BH
Belo Horizonte is the Brazilian city with the longest-lasting Participatory Budgeting experience. It represents fifteen years of participatory work with the population resulting not only in urban and social development but also in the improvement of the relationship among the municipal administration and the city’s residents.

The continuity and regularity of Participatory Budgeting in the city were gained thanks to the population of Belo Horizonte, which chose in 1993, a model of democratic and popular management. Over the years, the PB model built in Belo Horizonte reached a high level of sophistication, expressed by the methodology used to carry out the process, in the development of criteria to distribute the resources and in the selection of the public works. This level of sophistication can be conveyed by all the people that participate in the PB, through the countless initiatives to qualify the citizens and the staff of the city’s public administration.

Through this publication we intend to register the memory of this process and present a scenery of what was achieved during these last 15 years in close partnership with the city’s residents, which are the true protagonists of this history, turning Belo Horizonte into a more equalitarian and inclusive city.
In Athens, in the 4th Century B.C. ordinary meetings were carried out annually in the Agora, a Greek word for "the city square of decisions", where the population discussed its destiny. At the end of the 20th Century, Belo Horizonte began to experience democratic management, when, in 1993, the Participatory Budgeting (PB) program was implemented. Since then, 374,302 residents participated in assemblies and community meetings, deciding on the execution of 1,193 public works. From the beginning, this process was strengthened by the large numbers of participants.

In 2008, the Participatory Budgeting process brought together more than 44 thousand people across the city. In contrast to Athens, the popular participation in Belo Horizonte did not occur in one city square but in all the regions of the city of Belo Horizonte.
The year 2008 is special for the population of Belo Horizonte. The Participatory Budgeting program commemorates 15 years of existence and in December will officially inaugurate the 1000th public work chosen by the population. To have an idea of the impact that the PB had on the city, it is enough to say that today, 80% of the population resides within a distance of 500 meters from a public investment that was built with resources from the Participatory Budgeting program.

These investments include schools, health centers, cultural centers, areas of leisure, social housing and above all, infrastructure works which brought urban and social development to all the city's regions, especially to peripheral neighbourhoods and communities and favelas (i.e. precarious settlements), thus contributing to the reduction of social inequalities.

15 YEARS, 1,000 PUBLIC WORKS: THE POPULATION DEFINES THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE CITY
How everything began

Who could have imagined that a small village at the foot of the mountain range would, a hundred years later, transform itself into one of the most democratic capitals of this Nation? Since the 1990s, Belo Horizonte began to stand out for its popular participation in its city government.

Until 1993, the chief of the executive decided how to spend public money. Since then, there was a change in the style of governing: residents were called to participate and choose the most important public works to be carried out. This was the beginning of Participatory Budgeting.

Bernadete Prado Vansoncelos Alves, the Manager of Participatory Budgeting of the Regional Leste (i.e East District) affirms that “democratic management was pivotal in the process of fostering participation and in the definition of public investments to be carried out”.

And how can such an ambitious project be implemented, considering that it requires the involvement of the population and demands the integration of public policies? How could health, housing and cultural services be improved? All of these questions were agreed upon step by step amongst the City Hall, public managers and staff and the city’s residents.

The meetings occurred on sport courts, in schools, community centers and churches. If there was a lack of space, the living room of a small house with run-down walls would also serve as the meeting space to hear out the demands of the population. The meetings went on into the late hours of night, on Saturdays and Sundays – in the end, the city was tracing a new direction.

Natalice da Silva Moreira, a resident of the Regional Pampulha (i.e. Pampulha District), affirms that “we needed to work hard to convince people, to believe in the Project, but with the results participation grew. In this manner the PB gained credibility and turned itself into a channel, to voice out the desires and needs of the population”.

In fact, the process of discussing problems and finding solutions for the city, involving government, staff and society was not a challenge only for the population, but for all the technicians, which were still not familiarized with the forms of participatory planning and management. It was necessary to change the entire modus operandi of the administrative machine, through the implementation of new guidelines, norms and capacity building initiatives.
Allying the dialogue of the municipal administration with the popular movements and the improvement of infrastructure projects became a priority. Social mobilization stood out as the fundamental mechanism to disseminate this new form of governance.

Fausto de Souza, Manager of the Participatory Budgeting program of the Regional Oeste (i.e. West District), affirms that "we mapped out the various and existing community leaders in the region and since then we kept in touch permanently through phone calls, letters and visits, informing them of the PB meetings".

As a result, it is possible to observe the pedagogical, educative and political learning curve, fostered by the PB process of all those who were involved in the process. Heloisa Costa, professor of the Federal University of Minas Gerais, observes that "it is a learning process for both sides: for organized civil society and for the technical staff and public institutions which are not immediately permeable to change. Here it is important to consider the different timing of each actor: the timing of executing a physical intervention is different from the timing of building awareness in the community which is different from the timing of assimilating new values, etc. In the same manner, the timing of expectations within an imminent situation is felt with a higher degree of anxiety than for other demands" (Costa, 2000).

### POPULAR PARTICIPATION IN PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING (PB 1994 to PB 2009/2010))

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PB</th>
<th>N. OF PARTICIPANTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PB 1994</td>
<td>15,216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PB 1995</td>
<td>26,823</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PB 1996</td>
<td>38,508</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PB 1997</td>
<td>33,695</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PB 1998</td>
<td>20,678</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PB 1999/2000</td>
<td>22,238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PB 2001/2002</td>
<td>43,350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PB 2003/2004</td>
<td>30,479</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PB 2005/2006</td>
<td>38,302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PB 2007/2008</td>
<td>34,643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PB 2009/2010</td>
<td>44,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: SMAPL/GEOP
PS: The data for PB 2009/2010 is a projection. Adding up the Municipal Opening, the Regional Opening and the 2nd Round, 35,386 people participated in the process.
Inversion of Priorities

Throughout the years, the city transformed itself in the same way that the Participatory Budgeting has, adapting itself to the demands of the population, thus assuring a more equitable distribution of public resources. Maria Auxiliadora Gomes, coordinator of Popular Participation of the Municipal Sub-secretariat of Planning states that “the first step taken by the Municipal Administration was to invert priorities, by investing in the most vulnerable areas. If the resources for investment were extremely reduced beforehand, it was decided that 50% of these resources would be allocated to investments approved by the PB”.

The investments that were carried out to improve the quality of life of the population are visible throughout the city. In all the neighbourhoods, streets, avenues, and favelas of the city, PB is present. We can clearly observe, that the investments that were deliberated by the population at the beginning of the 90s, were basically related to infrastructure. As these demands were being met, the population began to choose public works in the area of health and education. Recently, it is possible to notice an increase in demands for leisure investments such as for sporting and cultural facilities.
Fátima Felix, representative of the Comforça of the Regional Oeste affirms that “the neighbourhood changed, contributing to the improvement in the quality of life. We brought schools, health centers, cultural centers and public squares to areas that were previously seen as areas of risk. In addition, an important investment was the construction of drainage canals to drain out rain water which would otherwise flood houses.”

Activist, for more than 20 years acted as president of the Community Association of the Homeless Movement from the Vista Alegre Neighbourhood in the Regional Oeste (i.e. West District), Fatima Felix, does not hide the pride of having participated in the first PB meeting in 1993.

“It was a historical [event], because it was the first time that residents participated in the decision-making process together with the local government. The victories of the PB program guaranteed to the residents one of the most important rights: that of citizenry. I was among the first elected representatives of the Review and Monitoring Commission of Participatory Budgeting Execution – Comforça”
MODALITIES OF PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING IN BELO HORIZONTE

Throughout its fifteen years of existence, PB in Belo Horizonte was amplified and gained new and innovative mechanisms of participation. The guiding principles of these innovations were: a) the increase of participation of residents from various social segments and places of residence; b) meet the specific demands such as social housing; and c) implement public works that would benefit the city as a whole.
REGIONAL PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING

The Regional PB defines the investments in all nine administrative regions of the city of Belo Horizonte, which are made up of a number of neighbourhoods and favelas. In this modality, the public elects through regional assemblies the public works for the two subsequent years. In addition to the investments, the population elects its representatives to integrate the Regional Review and Monitoring Commission of Participatory Budgeting – Comforça, which is responsible to monitor the execution process of the public works. The process is made up of the following phases:

Every two years, the City Hall and community leaders summon the population for the Opening of Municipal Participatory Budgeting

Mércia Adriana de Oliveira Cruz, manager of Participatory Budgeting from Regional Norte (i.e. North District) affirms that “this is the beginning phase of the process in all nine regional districts: residents, members of the Comforça, councillors of the municipal advisory boards for social assistance and health, members of the transport commissions and association representatives are called to participate. The city participates in the solemnity during which the Mayor officially opens the social mobilization process and announces the resources that will be allocated for investment”.

The First Round

During this phase, the PB regulations are presented to the community (described in two manuals entitled “PB Guidelines” and “PB Methodology”). The forms for raising demands are handed over to the community. The residents discuss and define the priorities. The Public Administration receives the forms, analyzes the demands and returns them to the community with a technical note informing the technical and financial viability of each demanded undertaking. Antônio Carlos de Souza, manager of Participatory Budgeting of the Regional Pampulha (i.e., Pampulha District) explains that “this is when the articulation and discussions on the undertakings begins. The representatives of the associations, unions, churches, and daycares receive the PB guidelines and clarify any doubts”.

Second Round

The 2nd round is carried out in the 41 sub-regions of the city. Each of the nine regional administrative districts is sub-divided into 3 to 6 sub-regions, which include various neighbourhoods, communities and favelas. During this phase, the residents in each sub-region pre-select the desired undertakings and elect the delegates to the Regional Forum of Budgetary Priorities. At the end of the second round, 25 public works are selected for each region.
Sebastião José Ambósio, manager of Participatory Budgeting of the Regional Noroeste (i.e. North-western District) evaluates that “the participation of the communities, especially in the second round of PB, is interesting, because it stimulates a healthy dispute amongst the neighbourhoods. Some residents withdraw their undertaking from the list in function of other demands, which are considered a priority”.

**Caravan of Priorities**

The City Hall presents a spreadsheet with the costs associated to every proposed undertaking to the delegates that were elected in the previous phase. The delegates visit the areas of the pre-selected public works to get to know better each undertaking and to gain a broader vision of the region’s necessities. The Caravan of Priorities visits all the neighbourhoods, communities and favelas which had demands approved during the 2nd phase.

José Adeilson Collares, manager of PB in the Regional Nordeste (i.e. North-eastern District), explains that “this is when the delegates have the opportunity to get acquainted with all the solicited demands. Through this manner, they are able to evaluate more appropriately the priority demands for the region and by doing so carry out effectively the exercise of democracy”.

**Definition of the Undertakings**

During the Regional Forum, the delegates discuss and select 14 public works per region amongst the 25 pre-selected demands identified during the second round.

Waldir de Paula Martins, manager of PB of Regional Centro-sul (i.e. South-central District), explains that “during this moment, the delegates need to be aware of their role as representatives of the community, and need to be able to evaluate the importance of the chosen public work. It is fundamental to have a conscious and responsible participation”.
Election of the Comforça

Members of the Regional Review and Monitoring Commission of Participatory Budgeting – Comforça, are elected at the Regional Forum. The role of the members is to follow up on the scope, the project and the course of the approved public works as well as to review its execution. For each edition of the PB program, a new commission is elected.

For Antônio Gomes, representative of the Comforça from the Regional Nordeste (i.e. North-eastern District), “this is the principal mechanism of participation of PB, since it represents the population in the monitoring and reviewing process of the approved public works”.

Antônio Gomes participates in the PB program since the beginning. Similarly to him, his parents Gentil Gomes and Maria José Gomes were community leaders. “This is a very democratic process, which I am proud to be a participant in. We choose not only what will benefit us, but also the undertakings that will benefit the community as a whole” affirms, Antônio Gomes, representative of the Comforça Nordeste.
The population assumed the responsibility to collaborate with the city’s administration. With the commitment, a lot of people learned how to fight for, value and take care of their region, transforming the peripheries of the city in a place adequate for living, with leisure areas, parks, decent housing, paved roads, water and electricity. “The PB program, gave to the population the opportunity to believe that a better future is built through victories, perseverance, synergy and is based on the obtained results”, says Mônica Ferreira, manager of Participatory Budgeting of Regional Venda Nova (i.e. Venda Nova District).

**Municipal Forum**

The last stage of the Belo Horizonte Participatory Budgeting program is the realization of the Municipal Forum for Budgetary Prioritization. The Mayor receives from Comforça the “Book of Undertakings”, which lists the public works to be executed by the public administration for the subsequent two years.

“The Municipal Forum is a moment during which the entire city has the opportunity to meet and exchange experiences of struggles and victories. It is also a moment to co-fraternize and commemorate the approved public works which will be executed over the next two years” highlights Wanderley Araújo Porto Filho, manager of PB of Regional Barreiro (i.e. Barreiro District).

**The Participatory Budgeting Management Board**

The review and monitoring of the execution of the public works is not only the responsibility of the population. If on one side, the community does its part through the Comforça, on the other side the City Hall has created the Participatory Budgeting Management Board – GGOP, to monitor and zeal over the undertakings to assure that their execution will be carried out, up to the highest quality standards.

The members of the board include secretaries, managers, and technical staff from the Planning, Budgets, and Information Secretariat, Urban Policies Secretariat, Education Secretariat, Health Secretariat, and the Municipal Cultural Foundation. The board has executive powers, and meets on a monthly basis to discuss and follow up on the tasks related to the PB process.
HOUSING PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING AND THE DEFENCE FOR DECENT HOUSING

With the objective to resolve a long-lasting and complex problem in Brazil – the high housing deficit – the Municipality of Belo Horizonte, increased the resources of the Participatory Budgeting program and in 1995 created the pioneer PB Housing program (“OPH” or PBH). For the first time, a local government was discussing with its population municipal budgetary resources allocated for the construction of housing units to benefit low-income families which partook in the popular movement for the fight for housing.

In 2008, Belo Horizonte contemplated 6,668 housing units approved through the PBH. Out of this total, 3211 units were handed over to the population. The remainder of the deliberated units are in the execution phase.
## Participatory Budgeting Housing (PBH)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PB BALANCE - YEAR 1995 TO 2008</th>
<th>HU</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HOUSING UNITS APPROVED (HU) IN PB</td>
<td>6.668</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HU CONCLUDED BY JUNE 2008</td>
<td>3.211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HU UNDER CONSTRUCTION</td>
<td>1.704</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOLIDARY CREDIT PROGRAM</td>
<td>839</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRO-HOUSING 2007 and 2008</td>
<td>497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FNHIS/OGU 2007 and 2008</td>
<td>368</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HU UNDER CONTRACT</td>
<td>612</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOLIDARY CREDIT PROGRAM</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRO-HOUSING 2008</td>
<td>504</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HU TO CONSTRUCT</td>
<td>1.141</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Information from NOD32 IMON 3566 (20081029)*
13th of December, 1999
Delivery of the first Popular Housing Complex

This is an unforgettable and historical date for the Homeless Movement, which realized a dream of having a “home of their own”, and for the city, which offered 144 quality housing units to its residents. Located in the Regional Nordeste, (i.e., North-eastern District) the Fernão Dias Housing Complex is an emblematic example of participatory management. “During this time period, the Nation was experiencing its worst housing deficit. The handing over of the keys on the 13th of December of 1999 was the biggest victory for the residents. In addition, through the Regional PB we were able to gain a health center, schools, paved roads, public squares and parks inside and in the vicinity of the housing complex. Finally, inside the housing complex we also have a library and a Socio-educational Center, which offers IT courses through the Digital BH Program” says Herval Simões Guido Júnior, a community leader of the housing complex.
ORÇAMENTO PARTICIPATIVO
DIGITAL 2008
Digital Participatory Budgeting, released in 2006, was an ambitious initiative of the Municipal Administration to amplify even more the popular participation in the decision-making process. For the first time in history, the population had an opportunity to participate and choose the public undertakings via internet. “Belo Horizonte assured a transparent and innovative voting process, through the active popular participation in the selection of the public works. It is through these kinds of means that the management of the city will continue to open the doors to build collectively the city’s future” affirms the president of Belotur, Julio Ribeiro Pires, Former Secretary of Planning, Budgets and Information.
The first public work of the Digital Participatory Budgeting program hand in to the population

The revitalization of the Raul Soares Square was the first public work of the Digital Participatory Budgeting program delivered to the population. The Square, which is considered to be an architectural landmark of Belo Horizonte’s downtown, is now being used again by the residents as a space of leisure. Built in 1936, and registered in 1981 as a heritage site of the State of Minas Gerais by the State Institute of Historical and Artistic Heritage (IEPHA), the reform of the Square was chosen by vote in the first edition of the Digital Participatory Budgeting program in 2006. The new fountain synchronized with lights, water and music, new marble benches and landscaped gardens are some of the principal characteristics of the intervention. The total investment of revitalizing this space totalled R$2.6 million.

Eight more undertakings which were selected through the Digital PB are in execution: five will be handed over to the population by December of 2008 and the remaining three will be delivered in the first semester of 2009.
Democratic Participation over the internet

The public works that were being selected through the Digital PB in 2006 received 503,266 votes, reiterating the participatory character of the population of Belo Horizonte. The Digital PB site received 192,229 hits from 23 countries.

To guarantee the participation of the population without access to the internet, the City Hall made available to the voters 152 digital inclusion centers including public and community internet hubs, Municipal Internet Centers (PIMs) and municipal schools which were used as public centers for voting.

“With the implementation of the Digital Participatory Budgeting program, Belo Horizonte consolidated a new practice, where digital inclusion became the element of social inclusion and of participatory democracy in society” highlights Silvana Veloso, director of the Digital Inclusion program of Prodabel.

Novelties in the second edition of the Digital PB

The 2008 Digital PB presented numerous novelties to improve the process. In addition to an increase of available investments by 100% (up to R$ 50 million will be available for the 2009-2010 period), this edition of the Digital PB was marked by a grandiose transportation project, benefiting the entire city and guaranteeing improved urban mobility.

The voting process was also amplified: in addition to online voting, the population could also vote by phone through a toll-free number made available to the population (0800).
Digital Participatory Budgeting is a pioneer project in Brazil and in the world

Based on the Digital PB experience, the Municipality of Belo Horizonte, received in France the “Good Practices in Citizen Participation” Award, given annually by the international Observatory of Participatory Democracy, in recognition of the most innovative experiences in the field of participatory democracy.

The community builds dialogue over the Internet

In Belo Horizonte, the Participatory Budgeting program also registered social mobilization characterized by independency. The interest regarding specific undertakings began to quickly manifest itself, and different sectors of the community implemented mobilization initiatives.

During the 2006 Digital OP, Caroline Craveiro, a resident of the Regional Pampulha, created the first blog for mobilization. The objective was to mobilize the community to vote for the construction of the Ecological Park of the Universitário Neighbourhood, known as Brejinho. With the selection of this undertaking, Caroline was motivated once again to build the blog of the Comforça Pampulha (http://comforcapampulha.blogspot.com).

“After realizing that a lot of people from my neighbourhood were following up on the news through the blog of the park, I had an idea to create another blog for the Comforça and by doing so, make information available to a greater number of residents, link up more community leaders from the different neighbourhoods in the Pampulha District and involve people which did not participate personally in the meetings” says Caroline.

Another blog was created in Regional Barreiro (http://msbarreiro.blogspot.com), administered by the resident of the regional district, Rômulo Venades. On the blog one can find news on the activities of the Comforça, on the regional councils and information on the social movements in the region.
PUBLIC WORKS APPROVED IN DIGITAL PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING 2006

Implementation of the Ecological Park in Brejinho

Reform of PAM Sagrada Familia

Hostil Construction

Implementation of Sporting Complex Vale do Jatobá

Center of Medical Specialties

Construction of the Ecological Park Telê Santana

Construction of the Cultural Arena Via 240

Connection of the North and Northeast regions
ESPAÇO BH CIDADANIA
Inclusão e integração em um só lugar.
A constant characteristic over the last 15 years of this experience in the city was the continuous strive to improve PB, aiming a more equitable distribution of public resources, and prioritizing areas with highest concentrations of poverty and social vulnerability in the municipality. The planning instruments developed and adopted by the Municipality were great allies in this process.
Amongst these instruments, the ones that stand out the most include: Planning Units (UPs) as territorial bases; the elaboration of the Quality of Urban Life Index (IQVU) to promote greater equity in the distribution of public resources; The Global Specific Plan (PGE), to diagnose and guide the integrated and structured interventions in the city’s favelas and; the geo-referencing of the PB undertakings.

Planning Units were defined in the City’s Master Plan in 1996 in function of the limits of the regional administrations, physical barriers (natural or built), land-use patterns and continuity of urban occupation. It is a methodological alternative that divides the city in 80 homogenous areas known as Planning Units.

The Quality of Urban Life Index measures the quality of life of a resident in the city, by calculating data on the access to the supply of goods and water supply services, social assistance, culture, education, sports, housing, urban infrastructure, environment, health, urban services, and security. In this case, the lower the
IQVU is for a region (representing a lower quality of life in the locale), the higher the volume of resources that it will receive for investment defined in the PB. The IQVU is used as a criterion for the allocation of resources for Participatory Budgeting since 2000.

The Global Specific Plan guides the actions of the public administration and the community demands in the prioritized areas such as precarious communities and favelas. To achieve this, a survey is carried out to diagnose the social, physical, environmental, and tenure situation in the favela as a whole. The survey points out the direction to recover the area socially, physically and legally and establish an order of priorities according which public works are executed with the participation of community representatives in the phases of the elaboration of the Plan. “In Belo Horizonte the PGEs serviced 330,043 people out of the 520 thousand that live in favelas or social housing projects, which corresponds to 56.47% of the population” affirms Maria Cristina Fonseca Magalhães,
director of the Municipal Urban Planning Authority of Belo Horizonte – Urbel. Since 1998, the PGE became the pre-requisite for the approval of interventions financed through Participatory Budgeting. Based on this guideline, up to 2008, it was possible to conclude 47 PGEs in 73 communities.

These instruments made it possible to identify priority areas with higher concentrations of poverty and social vulnerability in the municipality. As such, this gave urban planning an instrument to define public policy priorities, contributing directly in the execution of the City’s social programs. The demands presented by the communities in these regions began to count on a direct channel with the BH Cidadania Program (i.e. BH Citizenry) which promotes social inclusion of families that reside in socially critical areas, consolidating integrated action models in the social area.

Geo-processing is a tool that also contributes for the improvement of Participatory Budgeting. Through a database of geo-referenced data, it is possible to process quickly and effectively all the information regarding PB. The maps inform the localities and the current situation of all the PB-approved undertakings.
desegregated by theme (health, education, favela urbanization, infrastructure, etc.), by region UPs, neighbourhoods or streets.
TRAINING OF LEADERS

The more informed and trained are the citizens, the stronger and more effective will be the popular participating in the development of public policies. Through this approach, the Municipality of Belo Horizonte, during 15 years of Participatory Budgeting, invested in the qualification and development of community and Comforça leadership.
In partnership with the Urb-AL Network, capacity building courses were offered to more than 2000 leaders and people involved in the city’s participation network. The Urb-AL Network joins 700 cities in Latin America and Europe and currently has 1200 participants. Created in 1995, the network has put in place a decentralized approach to cooperation among governments to exchange, systemize and implement the best practices in the field of local financing and practices of participatory democracy.

“What I learned helps me in building a dialogue with the residents. An example of this is that we were able to re-discuss the priorities in the community. This is the role of Comforça. If we have access to information, it becomes easier to build consensus with regards to the priorities” says José Anastácio da Silva, representative of the Comforça of Regional Oeste.

**International PB Seminar**

The first International Participatory Budgeting Seminar, carried out in December of 2008 by the Municipality of Belo Horizonte, promoted an exchange of international experiences on PB, and discussed mechanisms to qualify the participatory processes and deepen the knowledge on participatory democracy.

“By joining countries, cities and collaborative organizations to debate limits, challenges, and possibilities of this form of participatory management, we gave one more step towards the improvement of quality of life of the population and towards the consolidation of participatory democracy”, affirms Ana Luiza Nabuco, Municipal Sub-Secretary of Planning.
Each one with its task and all together in the PB process

Building a better city goes beyond the individual vision of people that reside in it. In partnership with the population and through the use of tools such as Participatory Budgeting, the technical staff of the Municipality and the various public bodies has built a better place to live.

The collective effort of the teams of the municipal secretariats of Planning, Budgets and Information, Urban Policies, Regional Administrations, Social Policies, Health, Education and of the Municipal Culture Foundation was essential for the success of the PB.

Partnership between education and PB

For the commemoration of the 15 years of Participatory Budgeting, the Municipal Secretariat of Education gave space to debate the PB in the schools. Using the space given by the Integrated School Program, debates were carried out in partnership with the education community on the 15 years of the Participatory Budgeting. The students illustrated their impressions, through paintings on the walls that make up the path from the community to the school.
Due to its results, the PB experience in Belo Horizonte has become a national and international reference in participatory democracy. Today, Belo Horizonte is a point of encounter for other cities and countries that come to learn first hand the role of popular participation in the city’s decision-making process.
This recognition also came in the form of an award. In 2004, Belo Horizonte’s PB program won an award in New York in the “Improvement of Public Service Processes” category, given by the Organization of the United Nations.

“Representing Belo Horizonte at the UN and to have received the award was a great honour and one of the most important things that have occurred in my life” affirms Aldamira Fernances, representative of the Barreiro Comforça, which represented the community leaders in New York.

Aldamira Fernandes in front of the Urucuia Cultural Center
The Municipality of Belo Horizonte and the University of Harvard sign a cooperation agreement

Belo Horizonte was the first city in Latin America that was invited by the University of Harvard to sign an agreement for academic studies, thanks to the excellence in the performance of its planning public policies and popular participation. The objective was to promote the realization of studies and analysis of urban development plans through the Participatory Budgeting program. The academic activities of the students involved project development for the community of Apolônia, situated in the Regional Venda Nova (i.e. Venda Nova District).

The creation of networks strengthens participatory budgeting

To amplify the communication and foster the exchange of experiences between the Municipalities of Brazil which use the same mechanisms of popular participation, in 2007, the Brazilian Network of Participatory Budgeting was created among 27 Brazilian municipalities and is being currently coordinated by the Municipality of Belo Horizonte. 

"Although the first experiences of PB have arisen in Brazil, there wasn’t a Brazilian organization which would strengthen and bring together the cities that were developing these initiatives. In October of 2007, the proposal of constituting the Brazilian Network of Participatory Budgeting was approved, integrating the municipal experiences of Participatory Budgeting which were, until then, isolated" affirms the Municipal Sub-secretary of Planning, Ana Luiza Nabuco.
THE MAP OF BELO HORIZONTE
AND THE INTERVENTIONS

More than just a question of participating in all the selection rounds of the undertakings and the execution of hundreds of projects and public works under the careful and scrutinizing eye of the monitoring commissions, the Municipality of Belo Horizonte knows that, after the implementation of Participatory Budgeting, defining priorities for the city has been a different ball game.
The popular participation allowed for a successful encounter amongst the experienced professionals, with a lot to teach, with a population avid to point out where the difficulties lie and desires of change. The inversion of priorities on behalf of the local government is the synthesis of this new city.

The map of Belo Horizonte has been marked by the interventions. Areas that previously were left to oblivion, have seen engineers, architects, social workers and manual labourers dressed in red uniforms to build urbanized streets, new schools, health centers, cultural centers, ecological parks, and leisure areas. In the end, spreading democratically on a map of a city, 1000 undertakings could only result in one thing: a colourful vision of a homogeneity never seen before in Brazil.
Undertakings defined by the regional and digital participatory budgeting – up to the 30th of October of 2008

Legend
- Regional Limit
- Urbel Universe – 2004
- Favelas and Precarious Settlements
- Pampulha Lagoon
- Green Areas

NB: the undertaking of the Digital PB approved in the North-eastern regional district changed addresses and is now part of the Eastern regional district.

968 undertakings carried out through the PB from 94 to 2007-2008 period (30th of October, 2008)

216 undertakings in process from PB 94 to 2007-2008 period (30th of October, 2008)

1 undertaking concluded through the Digital PB

8 undertakings in process through the Digital PB

Source: SMAPL/GEOP/GEMOOP
Elaboration: SMAPL/GEOP GEMOOP/GIND - 2008

Map Base: PRODABEL/URBLE
Source: SMAPL - SARMU - SUDECAP - URBLE